# A Survey to Explore the Role of Organisational Justice on Organisational Citizenship Behavior among Irish Healthcare Employees

**Syed A. Jilani** Postgraduate Department of Business, Dublin Business School Dublin, Ireland

*Mahnur Gilani* Undergraduate Business and Management, Technological University of Dublin Dublin, Ireland

© Syed A. Jilani and Mahnur Gilani. This work is licensed under the Creative Commons Attribution-NonCommercial-ShareAlike 4.0 International License. To view a copy of this license, visit <u>https://creativecommons.org/licenses/by-nc-sa/4.0/</u>.

## Abstract

**ORIENTATION**: Organisational justice is crucial for an organisation's success and how it is perceived by employees. It develops great trust between management and employees, enhancing their job satisfaction, commitment, efficiency, and thus reduces turnover intention and improves the level of employees' citizenship behaviour.

**AIM**: This study is designed to determine the impact of organisational justice on job satisfaction, turnover intention, and organisational citizenship behaviour among healthcare professionals working in Ireland.

**MOTIVATION FOR THE STUDY**: The selection of healthcare professionals was to add another perspective and research dimension to the currently limited research material on organisational justice and citizenship behaviour among Irish healthcare professionals. Work exhaustion and turnover intention among healthcare professionals are the major issues faced by healthcare employees and management respectively and different forms of organisational justice play a major role in attenuating these factors.

**METHOD**: An online survey, using validated tools, was employed to achieve the research objective. A total number of 53 healthcare personnel participated in the study by completing a questionnaire comprising organisational justice, job satisfaction, turnover intention, and organisational citizenship behaviour scales and were evaluated for their organisational citizenship in terms of altruism, sportsmanship, and courtesy.

**RESULT**: It has been identified from this survey that organisational justice is positively related with job satisfaction and organisational citizenship behaviour, whereas negatively related with turnover intention among Irish healthcare professionals.

**CONCLUSION**: It is concluded that organisational justice is a strong indicator of organisational citizenship behaviour among healthcare professionals and also influences job satisfaction and turnover intention moderately.

Keywords: Organisational justice; Organisational citizenship behaviour; Irish healthcare employees.

### Introduction

In today's world where organisational culture has become more commercialised and customer-focused, the healthcare industry is also facing competing challenges to provide patient-centred care with high-quality services delivered meticulously with mindfulness and deference (Kolade, Oluseye and Omotayo, 2014). There is a virtual expectation from healthcare professionals to always go above and beyond what is required of them. This is the basics of organisational citizenship behaviour previously recognised as 'Extra Role Behavior' (Organ, 2018). This attitude plays an important role in making the work environment smooth and efficient in any organisation (Hidayah and Harnoto, 2018; Romaiha *et al.*, 2019), which, in the case of a healthcare organisation, can be seen in terms of high-quality care delivery (Mahooti, Vasli and Asadi, 2018.

The organisational citizenship behavior of an employee linked to any organisation is observed in the form of five attitudes, such as altruism, sportsmanship, courtesy, civic virtue, and conscientiousness (Podsakoff et al., 1990). However, the domains of organisational citizenship behaviour which are of major concern for healthcare professionals are courtesy, altruism, and sportsmanship. In today's world, primary care setups and healthcare organisations are under immense pressure because of multiple pitfalls. The major issue is an inability to attract and retain healthcare professionals as there is a worldwide shortage of them from top-level to bottom (Liu et al., 2017), especially in countries with an ageing population where demand exceeds the supply (Haddad, Annamaraju and Toney-Butler, 2019). Some of the other reasons are long working hours, shortage of qualified and trained staff, responsibility and stress level associated with the nature of the job, and inadequate remuneration for many categories of healthcare professionals, if not for all (Ali et al., 2019). All these factors cause resentment and job dissatisfaction among healthcare employees (Singh et al., 2019). Many of these factors are due to organisational injustice and failure of organisational leadership or policymakers (Aziri, 2011). Job dissatisfaction brings in other negative impacts such as no or low job commitment and increased turnover intention (Aziri, 2011; Gedif et al., 2018). These negative attitudes affect the organisational working environment and the efficacy and guality of service provided. The expectation of organisational citizenship behaviour from healthcare professionals in these circumstances can be said to be unrealistic. On the other hand, the culture of fairness in an organisation enhances employees' job satisfaction, promotes knowledge sharing and innovative performance, reduces burnout and turnover intention, and encourages citizenship behaviour (Imran, 2015; Akram *et al.*, 2020).

#### Perception of Organisational Citizenship Behaviour

According to Podsakoff there are two domains of organisational citizenship behaviour which are: interpersonal (also called 'helping behaviour') and organisational which is labelled as 'organisational compliance' (Podsakoff *et al.*, 2000). The interpersonal organisational citizenship behaviour indicates voluntary helping attitude among employees, in other words, it is the relationship between coworkers both laterally and vertically in terms of communication, interpersonal trust, and teamwork (Foote and Li-Ping Tang, 2008; Asamani, 2015; Gong *et al.*, 2018). A positive interpersonal organisational citizenship behaviour has a profound effect on both the individual and organisational achievements.

On the other hand, the organisational type of citizenship behaviour is related to employees' attitudes toward the organisation and execution of roles and responsibilities assigned by the organisation. It impacts the general performance of the organisation. The attitude of employees towards the job is measured in terms of job stress, work satisfaction, job involvement, work commitment, inspiration, and a healthy and growing atmosphere among all the members of an organisation. The employees that are more satisfied with their jobs are more likely to exhibit the dimensions of organisational citizenship behaviour and these attitudes are key performance indicators of employee performance (Koys, 2001). There are many positive consequences of employees' organisational citizenship behaviour on the organisation such as improved performance at all levels of hierarchy, effective allocation of limited organisational resources, reduction of unnecessary expenditures, welcoming and productive environment, cohesion among prospective and current employees, and maintaining organisational and employee performance stability (Sadeghi, Ahmadi and Yazdi, 2016).

In general, there are five types of organisational citizenship behaviour which an employee can exhibit as an extra role behaviour while performing assigned responsibilities in a work situation. These are: altruism, courtesy, sportsmanship, conscientiousness, and civic virtue. According to social psychologists, altruism can be described as a prosocial behaviour that refers to any action that benefits other people, without any self-interest. The term conscientiousness defines a personality trait that indicates the degree to which a person is organised, dependable, committed, perseverant, and focused. Civic virtue refers to employees' participation in the activities of the organisation such as meetings and training organised by the company to keep abreast of the current standing of the organisation and also to enhance their skills. Courtesy is an attitude which means that the employees in the organisation treat each other with respect. The working environment would be more comfortable and make things easier for the employees to work in a team. The last of the five types of organisational citizenship behaviour is sportsmanship which indicates the positive attitude of the people towards their work. They do not complain when faced with challenges in their work, instead they find solutions to come out of it by performing their level best.

According to Organ's (1988) definition of organisational citizenship behaviour, healthcare professionals might display organisational citizenship behaviour by covering shifts for colleagues who are late or sick, talking to each patient with respect and patience even with the busy, and often extremely stressful, work environment, delaying taking refreshment breaks to put the needs of patients first, actively taking part in improving rules and procedures in a healthcare setup to make them easier for both other healthcare employees or patients, helping orient new staff into the team and making them aware of rules and procedures. The healthcare profession is a profession in which the success of the organisation and the wellbeing of patients which is the utmost objective, is highly dependent on healthcare professionals going above and beyond, displaying organisational citizenship behaviour. The stress level associated with the nature of the job affects the organisational citizenship behaviour of healthcare professionals (Nabirye *et al.*, 2011; Kokoroko and Sanda, 2019).

#### **Dimensions of Organisational Justice**

Organisational justice should present in all the work environments, from organisational activities to allocation of rewards, intrinsic and extrinsic and any interaction between colleagues. There is a strong impact of an organisation's philosophy on employees' attitude and emotions such as organisational citizenship behaviour and job satisfaction (Castillo and Fernandez, 2017). By exploiting or manipulating these factors during policymaking and recruitment procedures, top management could have a strong command on the organisation's progress and effectivity. Organisational justice impacts directly, as well as indirectly, on employees' extra-role behaviour (Ali, 2016). There are three coincidental but well-defined domains of organisational justice: distributive, procedural, and interactional.

Distributive justice is the employees' perceived fairness of distributions of rewards, both intrinsic and extrinsic such as wages, promotions, social approval, job security according to their education, training, experience, and work performance based on different philosophical ideas such as equity, equality, and need (Baldwin, 2006). The equity principle is the distribution of rewards according to the employee's input to work. In 'equality', everyone enjoys the same benefits, whereas 'need' relates to personal circumstances of the employees such as disability allowance (Steiner *et al.*, 2006).

In terms of procedural justice, employees need to know why policies are in place, why certain procedures are carried out in a certain manner and why outcomes or rewards are distributed in a certain way. An organisation must keep employees fully aware of the agenda and strategy used to achieve a certain goal. The fulfilment of key attributes such as voice, transparency, fairness, clarity, and impartiality for implementation of organisational procedures is perceived as procedural justice (Cloutier *et al.*, 2018). Demonstration of these principles provides evidence of the extent to which employees are valued and appreciated by their organisations and increases employees' trust, confidence, and commitment (Boe, 2019).

Interactional justice deals with fairness in informational and interpersonal tasks among employees. The perception of justice relating to any explanations that are provided, and the conveying of information such as why procedures are conducted in a certain way is called informational justice (Muzumdar, 2012), whereas dealings of all employees, from top to bottom, with one another is interpersonal justice. Organisations that depict the culture of 'hard management' by using verbal forms of aggression such as yelling at employees, talking with disrespect by layoff agents, bullying, harassing and humiliating employees, create an unfavourable working environment and impose a negative impact on the perception of justice among employees (Yahaya et al., 2012; Richter et al., 2018). It is suggested that equitable, unbiased, and even-handed supervision reassures employees that they are valued and promotes a sense of belonging. Good working relationships are essential to the smooth functioning of an organisation (Swalhi, Zgoulli and Hofaidhllaoui, 2017). These virtues are significantly and negatively associated with emotional burnout and hence incur a positive impact on employees' and organisations' performance in general (Zoghbi-Manrique-de-Lara and Ting-Ding, 2017; Kyei-Poku, 2019; Lee and Chui, 2019). Demonstration of interactional justice among employees is a powerful antecedent of the employee's exhibition of organisational citizenship behaviour and reduced turnover intention (Muzumdar, 2012; "Human resource practices and their association with perceived organisational support: The mediating effect of interactional justice," 2019).

#### **Job Satisfaction**

Job satisfaction is a multifaceted construct, one that considers feelings of employees, and also considers how intrinsic and extrinsic job elements may affect them. Job satisfaction is a feeling that appears as a result of the individual's perception of how well their job meets their needs, whether they be financial needs or psychological ones (Aziri, 2011). The intrinsic factors which can affect employees' satisfaction at work are recognition of their services, along with opportunities for personal development and promotion, whereas the extrinsic factors include job security, remuneration, workplace environment, colleagues and management (Plumed Polo, 2016; Abuhashesh, Al-Dmour and Masa'deh, 2019; Ali *et al.*, 2019). The phenomenon of job satisfaction is crucial in terms of organisational success, due to its strong impact on employees' motivation and productivity (Saifi and Shahzad, 2017). It is proven that there is a significant link between job satisfaction and performance. The higher the job satisfaction, the higher the employee's performance and job commitment will be (Susanty and Miradipta, 2013). On the other hand, dissatisfaction at work and job strain negatively impacts the employee's performance, identified in a study performed among Iranian nurses (Wazqar *et al.*, 2017).

#### **Turnover Intention**

Turnover Intention is defined as "conscious and deliberate wilfulness to leave the organisation" (Tett and Meyer, 1993). There are many negative consequences for employees leaving the organisation such as customers' dissatisfaction, the reduction of employees' job commitment and morale, increased costs of rehiring and training (Emiroğlua, Akova and Tanrıverdi, 2015). Highly-skilled employees are especially important to organisations and losing them can be very disruptive for an organisation, especially ones that deliver services to customers. The reasons for employee turnover can be categorised as work-related, e.g. work environment, remuneration, etc., individual factors e.g. employee demographics and external factors e.g. recession, and the unemployment rate (Tian-Foreman, 2009).

#### Purpose and Significance of the Study

Healthcare organisations range from government-funded health services, private hospitals, nursing homes, polyclinics, and solo-general practitioner services. All these healthcare organisations, irrespective of the number of employees, are based on team-oriented culture. The team usually comprises licensed healthcare professionals and non-licensed governing bodies. Justice and collaboration between the two parties play a vital role in the provision of care services to the clients. Due to the stressful nature of work done by healthcare professionals at all levels ranging from consultants, specialists, resident doctors, general practitioners, nurses, healthcare assistants and other allied medical professionals, it is mandatory for the organisation to keep fairness and justice among all workers in every aspect (Ghasi, Ogbuabor and Onodugo, 2020). This avoids unrest and reduces stress, the workers will be more satisfied with their allocated job, perform well resulting in successful outcomes, leading to reduced turnover intention (Wang et al., 2012; Sultana et al., Therefore, it is very important for healthcare organisations to create a 2019). justified environment for all those who work together towards a common goal and all the team-players should perceive this fairness to keep their morale high and achieve the level of work satisfaction. When fair treatment is given to all employees, they are more galvanised and inspired, resulting in a positive work attitude.

The selection of healthcare professionals for this research adds another perspective and research dimension to the currently limited research material on organisational justice and organisational citizenship behaviour among healthcare organisations in Ireland. This study aimed to gain more insight into the plight of healthcare professionals and to identify the extent to which both these factors, organisational justice and organisational citizenship behaviour, interact in a healthcare setting. It also addressed how organisational justice in healthcare settings can have an impact on job satisfaction and turnover intention of healthcare employees, influencing the effectiveness of the healthcare organisations. This research may be of practical value to the management in healthcare organisations and can help improve the working conditions of healthcare professionals and thus provide benefits to the healthcare industry.

### Method

**Research Strategy:** This is a quantitative analysis of a cross-sectional survey, performed among the registered healthcare professionals working in Ireland.

**Population and Sampling:** The sample was working healthcare professionals, including general practitioners, doctors, nurses, and healthcare assistants working in Ireland. The snowball sampling technique, which is a non-probability sampling method was adopted to reach the potential participants. The total responses collected during data collection were 53. Almost an equal number of females (n=26, 49.1%) and males (n=27, 50.1%) completed the research questionnaires. The data was analysed by using the SPSS.

By profession, 49.1% nurses (n=25) completed the research questionnaires while 28.3% were doctors or general practitioners (n=15) and 18.9% were healthcare assistants (n=10).

The age range of the participants was between 25 to 65. Half of the participants belonged to the age group 26 - 35 years (n=25). Most of our research respondents (n=29) were working around 40 - 60 hours, which is 54.7% of the total respondents. The number of participants (n=10) working over 60 hours a week were mostly doctors or general practitioners which is about 18.8%.

**Data Collection**: The questionnaire used for this study was formulated by selecting valid and reliable inventories from the previous work of researchers. A Google survey form was developed comprising a brief description of the survey purpose, consent form, demographics, organisational citizenship behaviour instrument with

three of its five dimensions, comprising 12 items (Podsakoff *et al.*, 1990), organisational justice scale consisting of 20 items (Niehoff and Moorman, 1993), job satisfaction comprising 10 items (Goetz *et al.*, 2013), and turnover intention scale comprising 6 items (Bothma and Roodt, 2013). Demographic information obtained in this study was age, sex, profession, experience, and work hours.

Three of the five dimensions of organisational citizenship behaviour considered were altruism, courtesy, and sportsmanship which are of major concern for healthcare professionals and the rest were not included in the tool. There were four items for each dimension. All the items were measured on a 5-point Likert scale from 1 (Strongly Disagree) to 5 (Strongly Agree). The organisational justice tool consisted of 20 items and was divided into three parts, distributive justice comprising five items, procedural justice comprising six items and interactional justice comprising nine items.

After the formulation of the questionnaire, links were sent via mail, text and through social media platforms like LinkedIn. The survey link remained open initially for four weeks and then extended for another two weeks with a reminder sent to all potential respondents to receive more responses.

### Results

The descriptive and inferential analyses were performed to determine the frequencies of all variables and correlation between the variables, respectively. The variables with their mean (M) and standard deviation (SD) values are mentioned in table 1. The minimum and maximum score achieved by the respective instruments are also mentioned in Table 1.

#### Table 1: Frequencies of all the Variables

Variable	Mean (M)	Std. Deviation (SD)	Minimum	Maximum
Distributive Justice	13.28	4.67	7.00	25.00
Procedural Justice	17.01	5.78	6.00	30.00
Interactional Justice	27.07	9.25	10.00	45.00

Altruism	16.60	3.24	7.00	20.00
Courtesy	16.58	3.36	5.00	20.00
Sportsmanship	13.58	4.40	4.00	20.00
Job Satisfaction	44.37	12.38	20.00	66.00
Turnover Intention	19.18	3.94	10.00	24.00

The analysis of the relationship between gender and dimensions of organisational citizenship behaviour exhibited negligible difference among male and female healthcare professionals. An independent samples t-test indicated that there was no significant difference between females (M=16.15, SD=2.98) and males (M=17.03, SD=3.48) in relation to altruism levels [t (51) =-.98, p=.327]. There was no significant difference between females (M=16.46, SD=3.91) and males (M=16.70, SD=2.81) in relation to courtesy level [t (51) = -.26, p=.796], and also no significant difference found between females (M=15.03, SD=3.20) and males (M=12.70, SD=5.12) in relation to sportsmanship level [t (51) = 1.98, p= .053]. The mean and standard deviation values for altruism, courtesy, and sportsmanship for female and male healthcare employees are mentioned in Table 2, whereas the t-value and p-value are shown in Table 3.

Table 2: Tendency of organisational citizenship behaviour in female and male	
respondents	

Organisational Citizenship Behaviour	Sex	Number (n)	Mean(M)	Std. Deviation (SD)
Altruism	Female	26	16.15	2.98
	Male	27	17.03	3.48
Courtesy	Female	26	16.46	3.91
	Male	27	16.70	2.81
Sportsmanship	Female	26	15.03	3.20
	Male	27	12.70	5.12

Dimensions of OCB	t-value	df	p-value
Altruism (equal variances assumed)	989	51	.327
Courtesy (equal variances assumed)	260	51	.796
Sportsmanship (equal variances assumed)	1.98	51	.053

# Table 3: Hypothetical t-test analysis of dimensions of organisational citizenship behaviour

Pearson's correlation coefficient (Pearson's r) was used to measure the strength of the association between the tested variables. A Pearson's r correlation showed that there was a weak non-significant positive relationship between distributive justice and altruism (r =.166, p=.236), courtesy (r =.131, p=.350) and sportsmanship (r =.143, p=.308). A strong significant positive relationship between procedural justice and altruism (r = .522, p< .001), courtesy (r = .477, p< .001) and a negative relationship with sportsmanship (r = .170, p=.223) was identified among healthcare employees. There was a strong significant positive relationship between interactional justice and altruism (r =.564, p< .001), courtesy (r = .398, p=.003). and a negative relationship with sportsmanship (r = .196, p=.159). Hence the effects of procedural and interactional justice on the three tested dimensions of organisational citizenship behaviour were identified as same. The above-mentioned Pearson's r values are shown in Table 4.

Pearson's correlation between the domains of organisational justice and job satisfaction showed that there was a weak non-significant positive relationship between distributive justice and job satisfaction (r = .195, p = .163), moderately strong significant positive relationship between procedural justice and job satisfaction (r = .356, p = .009), and the same correlation between interactional justice and job satisfaction (r = .346, p = .011). The above-mentioned Pearson's r values are shown in Table 4.

Pearson's correlation for all types of organisational justice and turnover intention showed moderate to strong negative effect on the turnover intention among healthcare professionals. Pearson's r values obtained for distributive justice, procedural justice, and interactional justice regarding turnover intention were (r = -.588, p< .001), (r = -.306, p=.026), and (r = -.352, p=.010) respectively and shown in Table 4.

Variables	Pearson's r correlation	Correlation
Distributive justice & altruism	r =.166, p=.236	weak positive
Distributive justice & courtesy	r =.131, p=.350	Weak positive
Distributive justice & sportsmanship	r =.143, p=.308	weak positive
Distributive justice & JS	r =.195, p=.163	weak positive
Distributive justice & TI	r =588, p< .001	strong negative
Procedural justice & altruism	r = .522, p< .001	strong positive
Procedural justice & courtesy	r = .477, p< .001	strong positive
Procedural justice & sportsmanship	r =170, p=.223	negative relationship
Procedural justice & JS	r =.356, p=.009	moderate positive
Procedural justice & TI	r =306, p=.026	moderate negative
Interactional justice & altruism	r =.564, p< .001	strong positive
Interactional justice & courtesy	r =398, p=.003	strong positive
Interactional justice & sportsmanship	r =196, p=.159	negative relationship
Interactional justice & JS	r =.346, p=.011).	moderate positive
Interactional justice & TI	r =352, p=.010	moderate negative

# Discussion

The results of this study shed light on critical issues for both healthcare human resource managers and policymakers. Healthcare organisations need expert and efficient employees to provide quality care services and improve in all aspects, especially in hospitals and nursing homes. The mainstay of the healthcare system should be to create a culture of justice in all forms and to supervise and manage employees effectively (Chen *et al.*, 2015). The culture of fairness in an organisation enhances employees' job satisfaction, reduces burnout and turnover intention, promotes knowledge sharing and innovative performance, and encourages citizenship behaviour (Galletta and Portoghese, 2012; Huang, You and Tsai, 2012; Imran, 2015; Brienza and Bobocel, 2017; Akram *et al.*, 2020).

It has been identified from this survey that there is an overall positive relationship between organisational justice and organisational citizenship behaviour. Nastiezaie and Jenaabadi (2016), also reported that the exhibition of organisational justice has a significant and positive correlation with organisational citizenship behaviour. On the other hand, Pekurinen *et al.* (2017) conducted a study on nurses' attitude and stated that lack of organisational justice can hurt the behaviour of nurses towards each other and can even harm patient-nurse interactions. A study was performed on Korean employees and it was found that perceived injustice during work is associated with increased risk of occupational disease and absenteeism (Min *et al.*, 2014). The other study found that lack of organisational justice led to counterproductive work behaviour among Chinese public servants (Mingzheng *et al.*, 2014). Another study conducted by a researcher outlined that procedural injustice is the lead motivator for deviant behaviour in the workplace (Michel and Hargis, 2017).

This study found that there is a weak relationship between distributive justice and the three tested dimensions of organisational citizenship behaviour, altruism, courtesy, and sportsmanship. This challenges previous studies that proved that distributive justice is a strong predictor of organisational citizenship behaviour (Tremblay *et al.*, 2010; Yaghoubi, Afshar and Javadi, 2012; Biswas, Varma and Ramaswami, 2013).

According to the results, procedural justice is strongly correlated with altruism and courtesy, which is in line with prior studies that identified procedural justice as an important indicator of organisational citizenship behaviour (Pan *et al.*, 2018). Our results show a negative correlation between procedural justice and sportsmanship. This is in line with research conducted by Wan (2015), who found that the perception of procedural justice in employees had negative correlations with courtesy and sportsmanship. Both these results challenge prior studies which find that there is a positive relationship between procedural justice and the domains of organisational citizenship behaviour (Charles, 2016).

The study also reaffirmed that interactional justice is a strong indicator of organisational citizenship behaviour. The results are consistent with other research that found that interactional justice is significantly related to organisational citizenship

behaviour (Wan, 2015; Özbek, Yoldash and Tang, 2016). However, once again, interactional justice is found to be negatively correlated to sportsmanship.

This study concluded that there is a moderate positive relationship between all divisions of organisational justice and job satisfaction. Procedural justice had the most influence followed by interactional justice and then distributive justice. This is consistent with previous research which proves that perception of justice in organisations affects job satisfaction (Haar and Spell, 2009; Dundar and Tabancali, 2012). According to some researchers, procedural justice has a stronger influence than distributive justice on job satisfaction (Ahmadzadeh Mashinchi *et al.*, 2012). This study reaffirms this view.

As for the relationship between organisational justice and turnover intention, it was found that the perception of justice in organisations will lead to a decrease in turnover intention. In this research, distributive justice was found to have a very strong significant negative effect on turnover intention. Procedural justice and interactional justice also had a moderately significant negative effect on turnover intention. The findings of this study are consistent with work done by other prominent researchers who found that all three types of organisational justice have significant effects on the turnover intention of employees. (Öztürk, Ass and Bedük, 2016; Tourani *et al.*, 2016; Tsai, Wu and Chen, 2017; Jilani, 2020; Mengstie, 2020).

The opinion about gender groups displaying organisational citizenship behaviour is controversial. In this survey, it has been found that there is no significant relationship between gender and dimensions of organisational citizenship behaviour, which is supported by another researcher (Irmawati and Bekti Retnawati, 2018). However, some researchers have found that men tend to display some of the dimensions of organisational citizenship behaviour such as civic virtue, courtesy and sportsmanship more than their women counterparts (Punia and Shyam, 2017). Another study performed among Chinese employees reported that men exhibit more organisational citizenship behaviour than women across all the dimensions (Gao, 2020).

### Limitations of this Research

This study aimed to include more than 100 healthcare professionals working across Ireland but only 50 survey questionnaires were completed by healthcare professionals. This group was difficult to gather data from as healthcare professionals have many commitments and often cannot find time to take part in research or other activities. The respondents varied greatly in terms of their nature of work and general working situations which may have caused ambiguity in the interpretation of the results. Additionally, there may be other factors or relationships affecting variables and this may affect results. Results cannot be generalised to any subgroup of health professionals. This study did not consider any work-related attitudes that could have affected job satisfaction, organisational citizenship

behaviour, perception of organisational justice, and turnover intention. Causal analysis of organisational justice could not be determined as this was a transverse study. Additionally, organisational justice and organisational citizenship behaviour are subjective measures in this study so it should be taken into consideration that the responses are not a true representation of the employees' attitude.

#### **Recommendations and Further Research**

Research on a large scale is required with the collaboration of public and private healthcare regulatory bodies to evaluate and identify the driving forces for organisational citizenship behaviour and turnover intention among Irish healthcare employees. Organisations should provide adequate training for management to enhance specialist and interpersonal skills. These skills will improve relationships between healthcare professionals and their management. It is crucial in resolving a conflict between staff and management and thus improve the overall performance of healthcare organisations and professionals.

### Conclusion

Healthcare organisations are some of the most complex organisations both in terms of hierarchy and delivery of service. Employee JS and organisational citizenship behaviour is crucial to the success of such organisations as the services are related to human care. There is a lot of stress due to the nature of the job and the responsibility on employees' shoulders for efficient and effective delivery of service, keeping the quality high and maximum. However, even then, it seems that not much consideration is given to facilitate the virtues of organisational citizenship behaviour and its determinants in the healthcare industry. Based on this study it can be concluded that organisational justice is a strong indicator of organisational citizenship behaviour which in turn influences the quality-of-care delivery and efficiency of care providers by enhancing job satisfaction, job commitment, personal motivation and simultaneously minimising job stress, burnout, and turnover intention.

### References

Abuhashesh, M., Al-Dmour, R. and Masa'deh, R., (2019) 'Factors that affect employees job satisfaction and performance to increase customers' satisfactions," *Journal of Human Resources*, (1), pp. 1–23. Available at:

https://www.researchgate.net/publication/332471132\_Factors\_that\_affect\_Employees\_Job\_ Satisfaction\_and\_Performance\_to\_Increase\_Customers' Satisfactions (Accessed: 27 June 2020).

Ahmadzadeh Mashinchi, S., Yaghoubi, E., Ahmadi, E., Hadi, A. and Hamid, E. (2012) 'An analysis of correlation between organizational justice and job satisfaction', *African Journal of Business Management*, 6(3), pp. 995–1002. https://doi.org/10.5897/ajbm11.1622.

Akram, T., Lei, S., Haider, M.J. and Hussain, S.T. (2020) 'The impact of organizational justice on employee innovative work behavior: mediating role of knowledge sharing," *Journal of Innovation and Knowledge*, 5(2), pp. 117–129. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jik.2019.10.001.

Ali, F. S., Zuberi, B.F., Rasheed, T. and Shaikh, M.A. (2019) 'Why doctors are not satisfied with their job-current status in tertiary care hospitals', *Pakistan Journal of Medical Sciences*, 35(1), pp. 205–210. https://doi.org/10.12669/pjms.35.1.72.

Ali, N. (2016) 'Effect of organizational justice on organizational citizenship behavior: a study of health sector of Pakistan', *Review of Public Administration and Management*, 4(198), pp. 1–9. https://doi.org/10.4172/2315-7844.1000198.

Asamani, L. (2015) 'Interpersonal trust at work and employees' organizational citizenship behaviour', *International Journal of Business and Management Review*, 3(11), pp. 17–29. Available at:

<u>http://www.eajournals.org/wp-content/uploads/Interpersonal-Trust-at-Work-and-Employees---</u> -Organizational-Citizenship-Behaviour.pdf (Accessed: 11 April 2020).

Aziri, B. (2011) 'Job satisfaction: a literature review', *Management Research and Practice*, 3(4), pp. 77–86.

Baldwin, S. (2006) Organisational justice. Brighton: Institute for Employment Studies.

Biswas, S., Varma, A. and Ramaswami, A. (2013) 'Linking distributive and procedural justice to employee engagement through social exchange: a field study in India', *International Journal of Human Resource Management*, 24(8), pp. 1570–1587. https://doi.org/10.1080/09585192.2012.725072.

Boe, T. A. (2019) *Benefits of utilizing procedural justice principles in hiring and training officers*. Available at: <u>http://hdl.handle.net/10945/63433</u> (Accessed: 13 December 2021).

Bothma, C. F. C. and Roodt, G. (2013) 'The validation of the turnover intention scale', *SA Journal of Human Resource Management*, 11(1), pp. 1–12. https://doi.org/10.4102/sajhrm.v11i1.507.

Brienza, J. P. and Bobocel, D. R. (2017) 'Employee age alters the effects of justice on emotional exhaustion and organizational deviance', *Frontiers in Psychology*, 8(Mar), pp. 1–15. https://doi.org/10.3389/fpsyg.2017.00479.

Castillo, C. and Fernandez, V. (2017) 'Relationships between the dimensions of organizational justice and students' satisfaction in university contexts', *Intangible Capital*, 13(2), pp. 282–301. http://dx.doi.org/10.3926/ic.774.

Charles, E. (2016) 'The impact of procedural justice on organizational citizenship behaviour', *International Journal of Computer Applications*, 133(3), pp. 1–6. https://doi.org/10.5120/ijca2016907750.

Chen, S.Y., Wu, W.C., Chang, C.S., Lin, C.T., Kung, J.Y., Weng, H.C., Lin, Y.T. and Lee, S.I.

(2015) 'Organizational justice, trust, and identification and their effects on organizational commitment in hospital nursing staff', *BMC Health Services Research*, 15(363). https://doi.org/10.1186/s12913-015-1016-8.

Cloutier, J., Vilhuber, L., Harrisson, D. and Beland-Ouellette, V. (2018) 'Understanding the effect of procedural justice on psychological distress', *International Journal of Stress Management*, 25(3), pp. 283-300. https://doi.org/10.1037/str0000065.

Dundar, T. and Tabancali, E. (2012) 'The relationship between organizational justice perceptions and job satisfaction levels', *Procedia*, 46, pp. 5777–5781. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.sbspro.2012.06.513.

Emiroğlu, B.D., Akova, O. and Tanrıverdi, H. (2015) 'The relationship between turnover intention and demographic factors in hotel businesses: a study at five star hotels in Istanbul', *Procedia - Social and Behavioral Sciences*, 207, pp. 385 – 397. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.sbspro.2015.10.108.

Foote, D. A. and Li-Ping Tang, T. (2008) 'Job satisfaction and organizational citizenship behavior (OCB): does team commitment make a difference in self-directed teams?', *Management Decision*, 46(6), pp. 933–947. https://doi.org/10.1108/00251740810882680.

Galletta, M. and Portoghese, I. (2012) 'Organizational citizenship behavior in healthcare: the roles of autonomous motivation, affective commitment and learning orientation', *Review of International psychology social*, 25(3–4), pp. 121-145. Available at: <a href="https://www.researchgate.net/publication/255568301">https://www.researchgate.net/publication/255568301</a> Organizational citizenship behavior in healthcare <a href="https://www.researchgate.net/publication/255568301">https://www.researchgate.net/publication/255568301</a> Organizational citizenship behavior in healthcare <a href="https://www.researchgate.net/publication/255568301">https://www.researchgate.net/publication/255568301</a> Organizational citizenship behavior in <a href="https://www.researchgate.net/publication/">https://www.researchgate.net/publication/255568301</a> Organizational citizenship behavior in <a href="https://www.researchgate.net/publication/">https://www.researchgate.net/publication/255568301</a> Organizational citizenship behavior in <a href="https://www.researchgate.net/publication/">https://www.researchgate.net/publication/255568301</a> Organizational citizenship behavior in <a href="https://www.researchgate.net/publication/">https://www.researchgate.net/publicati

Gao, W. (2020) 'Gender and organizational citizenship behavior', *Advances in Social Science, Education and Humanities Research*, 415(Iss 2019), pp. 25–29. https://doi.org/10.2991/assehr.k.200312.006.

Gedif, G., Sisay, Y., Alebel, A. and Belay, Y.A. (2018) 'Level of job satisfaction and associated factors among health care professionals working at University of Gondar Referral Hospital, Northwest Ethiopia: a cross-sectional study', *BMC Research Notes*, 11(1), 824. https://doi.org/10.1186/s13104-018-3918-0.

Ghasi, N. C., Ogbuabor, D. C. and Onodugo, V. A. (2020) 'Perceptions and predictors of organizational justice among healthcare professionals in academic hospitals in South-Eastern Nigeria', *BMC Health Services Research*, 20(1), p. 301. https://doi.org/10.1186/s12913-020-05187-5.

Goetz, K., Musselmann, B., Szecsenyi, J. and Joos, S. (2013) 'The influence of workload and health behavior on job satisfaction of general practitioners', *Family Medicine*, 45(2), pp. 95–101.

Gong, B., Greenwood, R.A., Hoyte, D., Ramkissoon, A. and He, X. (2018) 'Millennials and organizational citizenship behavior: the role of job crafting and career anchor on service',

*Management Research Review*, 41(7), pp. 774–788. https://doi.org/10.1108/MRR-05-2016-0121.

Haar, J. M. and Spell, C. S. (2009) 'How does distributive justice affect work attitudes? The moderating effects of autonomy', *The International Journal of Human Resource Management*, 20(8), pp. 1827–1842. https://doi.org/10.1080/09585190903087248.

Haddad, L. M., Annamaraju, P. and Toney-Butler, T. J. (2019) *Nursing Shortage*. Treasure Island (FL): StatPearls Publishing.

Hidayah, S. and Harnoto, H. (2018) 'Role of organizational citizenship behavior (OCB), perception of justice and job satisfaction on employee performance', *Jurnal Dinamika Manajemen*, 9(2), pp. 170–178. https://doi.org/10.15294/jdm.v9i2.14191.

Huang, C.C., You, C.S. and Tsai, M.T. (2012) 'A multidimensional analysis of ethical climate, job satisfaction, organizational commitment, and organizational citizenship behaviors', *Nursing Ethics*, 19(4), pp. 513–529. https://doi.org/10.1177/0969733011433923.

'Human resource practices and their association with perceived organizational support: The mediating effect of interactional justice' (2019) *Human Resource Management International Digest,* 28(1), pp. 17–19. https://doi.org/10.1108/HRMID-07-2019-0196.

Imran, R. (2015) 'Impact of organizational justice, job security and job satisfaction on organizational productivity', *Journal of Economics, Business and Management*. 3(9), pp. 840–845. https://doi.org/10.7763/joebm.2015.v3.295.

Irmawati, B. and Bekti Retnawati, B. (2018) 'Differences in Ocb-I and Ocb-O based on gender: a case of insurance agents in Indonesia', *KnE Social Sciences*, 3(10), pp. 921–929. https://doi.org/10.18502/kss.v3i10.3436.

Jilani, S. A. (2020) 'The management and administrative practices resulting in the exit of nurses from the Irish healthcare system – a review', *DBS Business Review*, 3, pp. 17–29. https://doi.org/10.22375/dbr.v3i0.57.

Kokoroko, E. and Sanda, M. A. (2019) 'Effect of workload on job stress of Ghanaian OPD nurses: the role of coworker support', *Safety and Health at Work*, 10(3), pp. 341–346. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.shaw.2019.04.002.

Kolade, O. J., Oluseye, O. O. and Omotayo, O. (2014) 'Organizational citizenship behaviour, hospital corporate image and performance', *Journal of Competitiveness*, 6(1), pp. 36–49. https://doi.org/10.7441/joc.2014.01.03.

Koys, D. J. (2001) 'The effects of employee satisfaction, organizational citizenship behavior and turnover on organizational effectiveness: a unit-level, longitudinal study', *Personnel Psychology*, 54, pp. 101-114. https://doi.org/10.1111/j.1744-6570.2001.tb00087.x

Kyei-Poku, I. (2019) 'The influence of fair supervision on employees' emotional exhaustion and turnover intentions', *Management Research Review*, 42(9), pp. 1116–1132.

https://doi.org/10.1108/MRR-12-2018-0494.

Lee, H. and Chui, J. (2019) 'The mediating effect of interactional justice on human resource practices and organizational support in a healthcare organization', *Journal of Organizational Effectiveness: People and Performance*, 6(2), pp. 129–144. https://doi.org/10.1108/JOEPP-10-2018-0085.

Liu, J. X., Goryakin, Y., Maeda, A., Bruckner, T. and Scheffler, R. (2017) 'Global health workforce labor market projections for 2030,' *Human Resources for Health*, 15(11), pp. 1–12. https://doi.org/10.1186/s12960-017-0187-2.

Mahooti, M., Vasli, P. and Asadi, E. (2018) 'Effect of organizational citizenship behavior on family-centered care: mediating role of multiple commitment', *PLoS ONE*, 13(9), pp. 1–18. https://doi.org/10.1371/journal.pone.0204747.

Mengstie, M. M. (2020) 'Perceived organizational justice and turnover intention among hospital healthcare workers', *BMC Psychology*, 8(19), pp. 1–11. https://doi.org/10.1186/s40359-020-0387-8.

Michel, J. S. and Hargis, M. B. (2017) 'What motivates deviant behavior in the workplace? An examination of the mechanisms by which procedural injustice affects deviance', *Motivation and Emotion*, 41(1), pp. 51–68. https://doi.org/10.1007/s11031-016-9584-4.

Min, J.Y., Park, S.G., Kim, S.S. and Min, K.B. (2014) 'Workplace injustice and self-reported disease and absenteeism in South Korea', *American Journal of Industrial Medicine*, 57(1), pp. 87–96. https://doi.org/10.1002/ajim.22233.

Mingzheng, W., Xiaoling, S., Xubo, F. and Youshan, L. (2014) 'Moral identity as a moderator of the effects of organizational injustice on counterproductive work behavior among Chinese public servants', *Public Personnel Management*, 43(3), pp. 314–324. https://doi.org/10.1177/0091026014533898.

Muzumdar, P. (2012) 'Influence of interactional justice on the turnover behavioral decision in an organization', *Journal of Behavioral Studies in Business*, 5, pp. 31–41.

Nabirye, R.C., Brown, K.C., Pryor, E.R. and Maples, E.H. (2011) 'Occupational stress, job satisfaction and job performance among hospital nurses in Kampala, Uganda', *Journal of Nursing Management*, 19(6), pp. 760–768. https://doi.org/10.1111/j.1365-2834.2011.01240.x.

Nastiezaie, N. and Jenaabadi, H. (2016) 'The relationship of organizational justice with positive organizational behavior and work engagement from viewpoint of faculty members of Zahedan University of Medical Sciences', *Research in Medical Education*, 8(1), pp. 12–21. https://doi.org/10.18869/acadpub.rme.8.1.12.

Niehoff, B. P. and Moorman, R. H. (1993) 'Justice as a mediator of the relationship between methods of monitoring and organizational citizenship behavior', *Academy of Management Journal*, 36(3), pp. 527–556. https://doi.org/10.2307/256591.

Organ, D. W. (2018) 'Organizational citizenship behavior: recent trends and developments', *Annual Review of Organizational Psychology and Organizational Behavior*, 5(1), pp. 295–306. https://doi.org/10.1146/annurev-orgpsych-032117-104536.

Özbek, M. F., Yoldash, M. A. and Tang, T. L. P. (2016) 'Theory of justice, OCB, and individualism: Kyrgyz citizens', *Journal of Business Ethics*, 137(2), pp. 365–382. https://doi.org/10.1007/s10551-015-2553-0.

Öztürk, M., Eryesil, K. and Beduk, A. (2016) 'The effect of organizational justice on organizational cynicism and turnover intention: a research on the banking sector', *International Journal of Academic Research in Business and Social Sciences*, 6(12), pp. 544–551. https://doi.org/10.6007/IJARBSS/v6-i12/2517.

Pan, X., Chen, M., Hao, Z. and Bi, W. (2018) 'The effects of organizational justice on positive organizational behavior: evidence from a large-sample survey and a situational experiment', *Frontiers in Psychology*, 8(JAN), p. 2315. https://doi.org/10.3389/fpsyg.2017.02315.

Pekurinen, V.M., Välimäki, M., Virtanen, M., Salo, P., Kivimäki, M. and Vahtera, J.(2017) 'Organizational justice and collaboration among nurses as correlates of violent assaults by patients in psychiatric care', *Psychiatric Services*, 68(5), pp. 490–496. https://doi.org/10.1176/appi.ps.201600171.

Plumed Polo, P. (2016) The influence of intrinsic and extrinsic factors of working conditions on the job satisfaction.

Podsakoff, P.M., MacKenzie, S.B., Moorman, R.H. and Fetter, R. (1990) 'Transformational leader behaviors and their effects on followers' trust in leader, satisfaction, and organizational citizenship behaviors', *The Leadership Quarterly*, 1(2), pp. 107–142. https://doi.org/10.1016/1048-9843(90)90009-7.

Podsakoff, P. M., MacKenzie, S.B., Paine, J.B. and Bachrach, D.G. (2000) 'Organizational citizenship behaviors: a critical review of the theoretical and empirical literature and suggestions for future research', *Journal of Management*, 26(3), pp. 513–563. https://doi.org/10.1177/014920630002600307.

Punia, A. P. and Shyam, R. (2017) 'Gender difference in of organisational behaviour (OCB) and motives underlying OCB', *Psychological and Behavioral Science International Journal*, 4(2). https://doi.org/10.19080/PBSIJ.2017.04.555633.

Richter, M., König, C.J., Geiger, M., Schieren, S., Lothschütz, J. and Zobel, Y. (2018) "Just a little respect': effects of a layoff agent's actions on employees' reactions to a dismissal notification meeting', *Journal of Business Ethics*,153(3), pp. 741–761. https://doi.org/10.1007/s10551-016-3372-7.

Romaiha, N. R., Maulud, F.S.F., Ismail, W.M.W., Jahya, A., Fahana, N. and Harun, A. (2019) 'The determinants of organizational citizenship behaviour (OCB)', *International Journal of Academic Research in Business and Social Sciences*, 9(8), pp. 124–133. https://doi.org/10.6007/IJARBSS/v9-i8/6222.

Sadeghi, G., Ahmadi, M. and Yazdi, M. T. (2016) 'The relationship between organizational citizenship behavior and organizational performance (case study: Agricultural Jihad Organization of Mazandaran Province)', *Problems and Perspectives in Management*, 14(3), pp. 317–324.

Saifi, Akbar, I. and Shahzad, K. (2017) 'The mediating role of job satisfaction in the relationship between organizational justice and organizational citizenship behavior', *Pakistan Journal of Commerce and Social Sciences*, 11(1), pp. 126–146.

Singh, T., Kaur, M., Verma, M and Kumar, R. (2019) 'Job satisfaction among health care providers: a cross-sectional study in public health facilities of Punjab, India', *Journal of Family Medicine and Primary Care*, 8(10), pp. 3268–75. https://doi.org/10.4103/jfmpc.jfmpc\_600\_19.

Steiner, D.D., Trahan, W.A., Haptonstahl, D.E. and Fointiat, V. (2006) 'The justice of equity, equality, and need in reward distributions: a comparison of French and American respondents', *Revue Internationale de Psychologie Sociale*, 19(1), pp. 49–74. Available at: <u>https://www.cairn.info/revue-internationale-de-psychologie-sociale-2006-1-page-49.htm</u> (Accessed: 23 June 2020).

Sultana, F., Hossen, M.A., Akter, S. and Islam, M.A. (2019) 'Association between intrinsic rewards and OCB: evidence from Bangladesh', *International Journal of Education and Training*, 5(2), pp. 1–11. Available at: <a href="https://www.researchgate.net/publication/338791868\_Association\_between\_Intrinsic\_Rewar">https://www.researchgate.net/publication/338791868\_Association\_between\_Intrinsic\_Rewar</a> ds and OCB Evidence from Bangladesh (Accessed: 23 June 2020).

Susanty, A. and Miradipta, R. (2013) 'Employee's job performance: the effect of attitude toward works, organizational commitment, and job satisfaction," *Jurnal Teknik Industri*, 15(1), pp. 13–24. https://doi.org/10.9744/jti.15.1.13-24.

Swalhi, A., Zgoulli, S. and Hofaidhllaoui, M. (2017) 'The influence of organizational justice on job performance: the mediating effect of affective commitment', *Journal of Management Development*, 36(4), pp. 542–559. https://doi.org/10.1108/JMD-11-2015-0162.

Tett, R. P. and Meyer, J. P. (1993) 'Job satisfaction, organizational commitment, turnover intention, and turnover: path analyses based on meta-analytic findings', *Personnel Psychology*, 46(2), pp. 259–293. https://doi.org/10.1111/j.1744-6570.1993.tb00874.x.

Tian-Foreman, W. (2009) 'Job satisfaction and turnover in the Chinese retail industry', *Chinese Management Studies*, 3(4), pp. 356–378. https://doi.org/10.1108/17506140911007503.

Tourani, S., Khosravizadeh, O., Omrani, A., Sokhanvar, M., Kakemam, E. and Najafi, B. (2016) 'The Relationship between organizational justice and turnover intention of hospital nurses in Iran', *Materia Socio Medica*, 28(3), pp. 205–209. https://doi.org/10.5455/msm.2016.28.205-209.

Tremblay, M., Cloutier, J., Simard, G., Chênevert, D. and Vandenberghe, C. (2010) 'The role

of HRM practices, procedural justice, organizational support and trust in organizational commitment and in-role and extra-role performance', *International Journal of Human Resource Management*, 21(3), pp. 405–433. https://doi.org/10.1080/09585190903549056.

Tsai, Y., Wu, S.W. and Chen, S.C. (2017) 'Assessing the risk of turnover intention among hospital workers', *International Journal of Management, Economics and Social Sciences (IJMES)*, 6(Special Issue), pp. 244–258. Available at:

http://hdl.handle.net/10419/173240http://creativecommons.org/licenses/by-nc/3.0/www.econ stor.eu (Accessed: 30 June, 2020).

Wan, H. L. (2015) Organisational Justice and Citizenship Behaviour in Malaysia. Available at:

https://books.google.com.my/books?id=h1hECwAAQBAJ&pg=PA256&lpg=PA256&dq=proce dural+justice+and+sportsmanship&source=bl&ots=HfbpVy2AKM&sig=ACfU3U3D-fCLH4cx5 mWICGC5cpMPkbqqFA&hl=en&sa=X&ved=2ahUKEwjT193Q1qTqAhW49nMBHTXBC9sQ6 AEwA3oECAoQAQ#v=onepage&q=procedu (Accessed: 28 June 2020).

Wang, L., Tao, H., Ellenbecker, C.H. and Liu, X. (2012) 'Job satisfaction, occupational commitment and intent to stay among Chinese nurses: a cross-sectional questionnaire survey', *Journal of Advanced Nursing*, 68(3), pp. 539–49. https://doi.org/10.1111/j.1365-2648.2011.05755.x.

Wazqar, D.Y., Kerr, M., Regan, S. and Orchard, C. (2017) 'An integrative review of the influence of job strain and coping on nurses' work performance: understanding the gaps in oncology nursing research', *International Journal of Nursing Sciences*, 4(4), pp. 418–429. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.ijnss.2017.09.003.

Yaghoubi, M, Afshar, M. and Javadi, M. (2012) 'A study of relationship between the organizational justice and organizational citizenship behavior among nurses in selected hospitals of Isfahan University of Medical Sciences', *Iranian Journal of Nursing and Midwifery Research*, 17(6), pp. 456-460. Available at: <a href="https://pubmed.ncbi.nlm.nih.gov/23922589/">https://pubmed.ncbi.nlm.nih.gov/23922589/</a> (Accessed: 27 June 2020).

Yahaya, A., Ing, T.C., Lee, G.M., Yahaya, N., Boon, Y., Hashim, S., Taat, S. and Jesus, S.K.C.I. (2012) 'The impact of workplace bullying on work performance', *Archives Des Sciences*, 65(4), pp. 18-28.

Zoghbi-Manrique-de-Lara, P. and Ting-Ding, J. M. (2017) 'Employees' justice perceptions as a factor influencing successful outsourcing in the hospitality industry', *International Journal of Contemporary Hospitality Management*, 29(6), pp. 1619–1637. https://doi.org/10.1108/IJCHM-09-2015-0477.